VIRGINIA FAIR HOUSING BOARD

MINUTES OF MEETING

March 4, 2015

The Fair Housing Board Meeting was held at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

Jim Ginnell, Chair
Francis Stevens
Bob Boynton
Rosemary Wilson
Linda Broady-Myers
Erica Woods-Warrior (arrived at 10:02 A.M.)
Larry Murphy
Linda Melton
Myra Howard

The following Board members were absent:

Andrew Reisinger Bob Schaberg Kevin Lewis

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Jay DeBoer, Director
Mark Courtney, Senior Director
Christine Martine, Executive Director
Jeffrey Williams, Board Administrator
Liz Hayes, Fair Housing Administrator
Deanda Shelton, Assistant Fair Housing Administrator
Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant
Angela Keefe-Thomas, Fair Housing Investigator
Dominica McGowen, Fair Housing Investigator
Trudy Miller, Fair Housing Investigator

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General with the Office of the Attorney General, was present.

Mr. Ginnell called the meeting to order at 10:00 A.M. Call to Order

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Agenda

Melton to approve the Agenda. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, and Wilson.

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Stevens to approve the December 9, 2014, Fair Housing Board Meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy and Stevens. Wilson abstained from discussion or voting in this matter.

Minutes

Helen Hardiman, Director of Fair Housing with H.O.M.E., updated the Board on current and future H.O.M.E. endeavors.

Public Comment

Liz Hayes updated the Board on the current investigative Fair Housing case load.

Administrator's Report

Erica Woods-Warrior arrived at 10:02 A.M.

Arrival of Board Member

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-01219, Karen Garnett v. Fore Courthouse Seniors, LP, and Fore Property Company, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and supplemental Final Karen Garnett, complainant, was Investigative Report. present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Woods-Warrior to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion Members voting "Yes" were: passed unanimously. Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Boynton. Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-01219, Karen Garnett v. Fore Courthouse Seniors, LP, and Fore Property Company

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-00021, Amil FHB File Number 2014-Turakhia v. Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. Cortney Bright, Billy Ballou and Community Group, Inc., the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis, supplemental Final Investigative Report and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Jeffrey Hunn, attorney for the respondents, was present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers to find no reasonable cause that

00021, Amil Turakhia v. Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. Cortney Bright, Billy Ballou and Community Group, Inc.

respondents engaged in discriminatory terms and conditions based upon color and/or national origin. The motion passed Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, unanimously. Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

A motion was made by Ms. Woods-Warior and seconded by Mr. Stevens to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainant by enforcing different terms and conditions in regard to the use of common areas based upon familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Woods-Warrior to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainant by interfering with the complainant's fair housing rights based upon familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to find no reasonable cause that Cortney Bright engaged in any discriminatory conduct in her individual capacity. The motion passed unanimously. voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard. Melton, Murphy. Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-02342, Jeffrey and Michelle Croniser v. Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. and Billy Ballou, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Case Analysis Report and and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum Association, Inc. and Billy from the Office of the Attorney General. Jeffrey Croniser, complainant, and Jeffrey Hunn, attorney for the

FHB File Number 2014-02342, Jeffrey and Michelle Croniser v. Belmeade at Ridgely **Manor Condominium** Ballou

respondents, were present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Stevens to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainants by enforcing different terms and conditions in regard to the use of common areas based upon familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

A motion was made by Ms. Woods-Warrior and seconded by Mr. Boynton to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainants by interfering with the complainants' fair housing rights based upon familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy. Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-02363, Reed and Jill Stuart v. Belmeade at Ridgley Manor Condominium Association, Inc. and Billy Ballou, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General. Jeffrey Hunn, attorney for the respondents, was present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Stevens to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainants by enforcing different terms and conditions in regard to the use of common areas based upon The motion passed unanimously. familial status. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

A motion was made by Mr. Stevens and seconded by Mr. Boynton to find reasonable cause that the respondents discriminated against the complainants by interfering with the complainants' fair housing rights based upon familial status. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting

FHB File Number 2014-02363, Reed and Jill Stuart v. Belmeade at Ridgley Manor Condominium Association, Inc. and Billy Ballou

"Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens and Woods-Warrior. Ms. Wilson abstained from voting in this matter due to a potential conflict of interest.

At 10:42 A.M., Mr. Murphy offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Ms. Howard, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Liz Hayes, Dominica McGowen and Jay DeBoer.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

- 9. File No. 2014-00021 Amil Turakhia v. Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. Cortney Bright, Billy Ballou and Community Group, Inc.;
- 10. File No. 2014-02342 Jeffrey and Michelle Croniser Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. and Billy Ballou; and
- File No. 2014-02363 Reed and Jill Stuart v. Belmeade at Ridgely Manor Condominium Association, Inc. and Billy Ballou

At 10:57 A.M., a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Boynton that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law:

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair

Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 8-0

AYES: The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers. Ginnell. Howard, Melton, Murphy. Stevens and Woods-Warrior.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: Wilson.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Lewis, Reisinger and Schaberg.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-00941, Faith Hardy v. Fore Frontier Ridge, LP, dba Frontier Ridge Apartments, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A statement from Faith Hardy, complainant, was presented to the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Stevens and seconded by Ms. Wilson to find no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-00941, Faith Hardy v. Fore Frontier Ridge, LP, dba Frontier Ridge **Apartments**

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-00388, Terry Presmont v. United Dominion Realty, Inc. and United Dominion Realty, L.P., the Board reviewed the record United Dominion Realty, which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Ms. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Murphy to find no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-00388, Terry Presmont v. Inc. and United Dominion Realty, L.P.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-00597, Khudhur and Hadeel Ali v. Mosby Heights Associates II, LP, Mosby Heights Associates LP, Equity Management, Inc. and Angela Wiseman, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Ms. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Melton to find no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-00597, Khudhur and Hadeel Ali v. Mosby Heights Associates II, LP, **Mosby Heights Associates** LP, Equity Management, Inc. and Angela Wiseman

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-00608, Danielle Nichol Bonner v. Rodney Bywaters and Kay Partlow Bywaters et al ACP Trust #2, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report Case Analysis and Recommendation, and a Supplemental Final Investigative Report. A motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Mr. Murphy to find The motion passed unanimously. no reasonable cause. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-00608, Danielle Nichol Bonner v. Rodney **Bywaters and Kay** Partlow Bywaters et al **ACP Trust #2**

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-03828, Kelvin Jackson v. Rosser, LLC, Stefanie Harris and Nationwide Property Management, Inc., a motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Woods-Warrior to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed The motion passed unanimously. to by the parties. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2014-03828, Kelvin Jackson v. Rosser, LLC, Stefanie Harris and Nationwide Property Management, Inc.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2015-01287, Ramgopal Madhula and Srilatha Aimala v. Culpeper Farms, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Woods-Warrior to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The Farms, LLC motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton. Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2015-01287, Ramgopal Madhula and Srilatha Aimala v. Culpeper

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-03293, Housing FHB File Number 2014-Opportunities Made Equal of Virginia, Inc. v. BH 03293, Housing

Media Group Holdings, Inc., a motion was made by Mr. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Woods-Warrior to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

Opportunities Made
Equal of Virginia, Inc. v.
BH Media Group
Holdings, Inc.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2014-01663, Housing Opportunities Made Equal of Virginia, Inc. v. Carol J. Donaldson, a motion was made by Ms. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Howard to refer the file to the Office of the Attorney General to enforce compliance with the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the respondent. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2014-01663, Housing Opportunities Made Equal of Virginia, Inc. v. Carol J. Donaldson

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-01585, Sophia Shelton v. Space Properties, Hopkins Land Company and Robert Owens, a motion was made by Ms. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Howard to refer the file to the Office of the Attorney General to enforce compliance with the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the respondent. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Boynton, Broady-Myers, Ginnell, Howard, Melton, Murphy, Stevens, Wilson and Woods-Warrior.

FHB File Number 2011-01585, Sophia Shelton v. Space Properties, Hopkins Land Company and Robert Owens

Tom Payne gave the Board a litigation update.

Old Business

The Board adjourned at 11:34 A.M.

Andrew Reisinger, Vice-Chair

Jay DeBoer, Secretary

1.	Name: Linda Broady-Myers
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature $\frac{3-4-15}{Date}$

1.	Name: Bob Boynton
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	MobiuMA3 3/4/2015 Signature 3/4/2015

1.	Name: Myra Howard
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature 3.4.15 Date

1.	Name:Erica Woods-Warrior
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation o group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the publi interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Francis Stevens
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Am Steers 3/4/15 Signature Date

1.	Name: Rosemary Wilson
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	9,10,11
	(Agenda Item)
t.	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction: freeds with Ledwelger Jelen Dayas and Julieve the Condu association is Managed by Joy Lee Compan I declare that I am a member of the following business profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	☐ I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Rashnery Wilson 3/4/15 Signature Date

1.	Name:
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	3 4 2015

1.	Name: Larry B. Murphy
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation o group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the publi interest. or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.

1.	Name: Linda R. Melton
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: March 4, 2015 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Ruda Melty Much 4, 2015 Signature Date