

Carbon Life-Cycle Analysis Meeting
HB2026
June 30, 2023
Virginia Department of Forestry (DOF) Board Room

Stakeholder Representatives in Attendance: Rob Farrell (DOF); Terry Lasher (DOF); Ron Jenkins (VA Loggers); David Carr (SELC); Martha Moore (VAFB); Corey Conners (VA Forestry); Kyle Shreve (VFA/Advantus Strategies); Nikki Rovner (TNC); Mike Davis (NOVEC); Liz Willoughby (Dominion Energy); Judy Dunscomb (TNC); Ember Jenison (DOF); Jennifer Leach (DOF)

Stakeholder Representative Virtual Attendees: Mike Dowd (DEQ); Tom Ballou (DEQ); Elizabeth Gayne (Dominion Energy); Brent Hughes (DOE); Larry Corkey (DOE); Ian McDonald (DEQ); Susan Seward (VFPA)

Other Virtual Attendees: Brad Copenhaver (VA Agribusiness); Zach LeMaster; Mary Stuart-Torbeck; Teri Ramey (DOF COVES Fellow); Thomas Buchholz, SIG (Speaker); Robert Crockett

House Bill (HB) 2026 – Renewable energy; biomass-fired facilities; Department of Forestry advisory panel; report.

Department of Forestry and the House Bill 2026 biomass carbon life-cycle analysis stakeholder process.

*“Removes the renewable energy requirement for each Phase I and Phase II Utility to retire all biomass-fired electric generating units that do not co-fire with coal by December 31, 2028. ... The bill further directs the Department of Forestry to develop by December 1, 2023, best management practices for the sustainable harvesting of biomass for biomass-fired electric generating units that are subject to the provisions of the bill. This bill is identical to **SB 1231.**”*

HB 2026 restoring biomass as an energy source in the Cleaning Economy Act and has some clauses that relate to the Department of Forestry. Three tasks before DOF and stakeholders:

1. Develop Biomass BMPs

DOF shall develop best management practices for the sustainable harvesting of biomass. Needs to be completed by December 1, 2023.

2. Perform a Carbon Life-Cycle Analysis (This is what this group is going to focus on.)

These BMPs shall include a life-cycle carbon analysis, developed in coordination with DEQ and relevant stakeholders, that includes all carbon emissions, including supply chain emissions, forgone sequestration, and the emission from burning biomass resources from electricity generation.

3. Convene an Advisory Panel

DOF shall convene an advisory panel consisting of DEQ, DOE, industry, environmental organizations, VCE, and other stakeholders as DOF deems appropriate and submit a report of the advisory panel’s findings and any recommendations no later than December 1, 2024.

Right now, we are focused on our carbon life-cycle analysis task, which will be incorporated into our biomass BMPs.

Challenges we are facing:

- DOF does not have any expertise in carbon life-cycle analysis.
- DOF does not have additional funding to perform the carbon life-cycle analysis.
- We need to get it done by December 2023.

Focus for today meeting:

- Setting the stage.
- Lean more about carbon LCA.
- Figure out scope and data needs.

We have selected a small number of stakeholder entities:

Southern Environmental Law Center – David Carr
Nature Conservancy – Judy Dunscomb, Nikki Rovner
Virginia Forestry Association – Corey Conners, Kyle Shreve, Advantus Strategies, LLC
Virginia Farm Bureau – Martha Moore, Zach Jacobs
VA Forest Products Assoc. – Susan Seward
VA Loggers Assoc. – Ron Jenkins
Dept. of Environmental Quality – Mike Dowd, Thomas Ballou
Dept. of Energy – Brent Hughes, Ed Cronin, Larry Corkey
Dept. of Forestry – Rob Farrell, state forester; Terry Lasher, assistant state forester
Dominion Energy – Liz Willoughby, Molly Parker, Christina Hager, Elizabeth Gayne
NOVEC – Mike Davis

Public comments will be taken at the end of the meetings. The meeting link is available for the public and feel free to share also. Future meeting links will be available as well.

Presentation: *Life Cycle Assessment as A Tool for Bioenergy Carbon Accounting*

Thomas Buchholz, PhD

Senior Scientist – Spatial Informatics Group, LLC, Pleasanton, CA

Next Steps

1. Create a shared site for everyone to access and be able to place resources there.
2. Create goal and scope:
 - a. There are site specific and state specific issues.
 - b. Start looking at base load information or base data that we already have. Maybe get some information from Dominion and others in the area that would help us create a base floor to start with and then work from there up.
 - c. Questions were raised related to inclusion of NOVEC in the LCA since the NOVEC plant isn't covered by the Virginia Clean Economy Act. If the LCA is limited to the three Dominion plants do we need something broader in order to determine the best management practices?
 - d. TNC worked with Thomas Buccholz to come up with a list of what elements might be and we will make that available. The presentation was intended to show how Thomas Buccholz would approach an LCA, it's not necessarily the way that we are going to approach ours.
 - e. The purpose of this carbon lifecycle analysis is that the end result of that is to be able to develop best management practices for harvesting biomass.
 - f. Two scenarios discussed:
 - i. Life without HB2026 and life with HB2026.
 - ii. Dominion was planning to close these plants. HB2026 passes and Dominion now get REC's and plants can run for 15 to 25-year period based on those REC's. Compare running the plants and not running as biomass plants.
3. If someone has a suggestion for another perspective and could share the presentation that we just had and see if someone sees it differently. Want to be fair to the group to hear somebody else's perspective of how

you do this and then may help to narrow down the issues and the scenarios that we would build this ultimate evaluation from.

Rob Farrell will send out an email to invite stakeholders to suggest others to give presentations.

Public Comments

- None

Stakeholder Follow-up Questions and Comments

- Is the LCA only going to be conducted at the 3 Dominion facilities?
- Is there a reason why the NOVEC facility is not identified?
- Haul radius should be expanded.

Elements/Scenarios for stakeholders to include:

- The challenge is to make sure the scenarios you pick really describe reality on the ground.
- Change in market of pulpwood.
- Changes in the landscape; urban, shopping mall, solar facility, etc.
- Management practices stakeholders know are going on: controlled burn, efficient replanting, pile up, etc.

Meeting concluded.