



# Resilience Coordination Working Group

*Meeting Summary September 26, 2023*

## Opening Remarks

Matthew Wells, Director, Virginia Department of Conservation and Recreation (DCR)

## Feedback Discussion

Facilitated by Gina Barber, Center for Public Policy (CPP)

Gina Barber shared that the electronic straw poll administered to the working group in September captured members' feedback on revised recommendations. The revisions included in the straw poll were meant to address the concerns raised by the working group during the August 25<sup>th</sup> meeting. In addition to language changes, these revisions consolidated the recommendations, reducing the total number from 32 to 23.

Working group members discussed recommendations that were rated in the straw poll results as needing more discussion by 3 or more members. During that time, members were able to propose amendments to the recommendations in question. Any proposed changes were followed by a vote prior to a final vote on all final recommendations. After discussion, each organization cast a vote on each of the final draft of recommendations (one vote per organization per recommendation).

The four recommendations that received 3 or more votes for "More Discussion Needed" in the straw poll were: B.2, C.1, C.2, and E.1. Recommendation F.4 received a vote for "Serious Disagreement" but was not discussed during the meeting.

**Recommendations Needing More Discussion**

Presented by CPP

Recommendation	Discussion Notes
<p><b>B.2: The CRO should be authorized to serve as Virginia’s non-federal sponsor/applicant for USACE Civil Works Programs and other federal funding programs.</b> The CRO should be tasked with working across relevant agencies and localities to seek these funding opportunities and make applications on behalf of the Commonwealth. Where a specific agency or local government is required, or better suited, to be the applicant (such as the STORM program), the CRO will be designated to support the application, and lead coordination between agencies and ensure alignment with the Commonwealth’s overall resilience goals.</p>	<p>There was a request to amend the language to say “for resiliency-related projects” so as not to encompass Civil Works projects where the Virginia Port Authority should serve as the non-federal sponsor.</p> <p>It was asked whether the state could serve as a non-federal sponsor if the project isn’t on state-owned land, and what would happen if the state were not the appropriate sponsor. Ms. Barber explained that the language in the recommendation implies that the state will only serve if “appropriate”.</p> <p>Ms. Barber reminded the working group that the resilience language throughout the recommendations is consistent with the resilience definition in state code.</p>
<p><b>C.1: The state should provide capacity-building support to local governments seeking to address resilience challenges.</b> To ensure success, the state should consider the following actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Providing support to localities from the Office of Resilience by establishing local support positions within the Office.</li> <li>ii. Establishing “grant specialist/local support” positions to support select localities in procuring resilience funding, based on demonstrated need. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Consider a structure that allows positions to work closely with or be embedded within PDCs serving under-resourced communities and share regional information on local capacity back to the state’s resilience entities.</li> <li>b. Study these positions to determine the best placement and costs for these roles.</li> <li>c. Evaluate the Virginia DEQ CZM’s grants program and other agency</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>There was discussion regarding the differences between sub-bullets contained in the recommendation. Some members expressed that broader language, specifically related to localities and placement of positions, would make the recommendation less prescriptive. Other members noted that, as PDCs are a known and authorized delivery mechanism, calling them out as examples could ensure an alternate structure isn’t created for these positions.</p> <p>It was suggested to move recommendation F.1 (for state established goals, metrics, and best practices for locality readiness) into C.2 to create an aligned, statewide strategy that localities and PDCs could use as a guide. Opposition was voiced to designating establishment of resilience metrics and goals as a legislative recommendation. There was some shared agreement that metrics should remain administrative to create flexibility in development and use. However, several members stated that resilience metrics and goals should be not solely left to the Office of the CRO nor the legislature,</p>

**RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP**

*Meeting Summary September 26, 2023*

Recommendation	Discussion Notes
<p>structures as potential models (e.g., VDEM Regional Support structure within the VDEM Disaster Services Bureau).</p>	<p>but rather the combined efforts of all relevant state government agencies.</p>
<p><b>C.2: The state should consider funding resilience tools, including the RAFT (Resilience Adaptation Feasibility Tool), a collaborative state university “boots on the ground” tool highlighted in Virginia’s Coastal Resilience Master Plan for supporting under-resourced local governments and federally and state recognized Tribes across the Commonwealth as well as other resilience tools that will help localities and recognized Tribes advance their resilience.</b></p>	<p>It was noted that there have been several iterations of this recommendation put forth by the working group. Several members felt that inclusion of the RAFT, while important, may lead to a narrowing of focus. Additionally, there was acknowledgement that similar recommendations are more general and do not include similarly detailed examples.</p>
<p><b>E.1: The state should evaluate creating a mechanism to enable the use of private funding by state agencies.</b></p>	<p>Several suggestions were offered to improve the language, grammar, and overall clarity of this recommendation.</p> <p>It was suggested that adding localities could help address challenges in procurement of private donations. For example, it is currently difficult for PDCs or localities to receive donations from private citizens.</p> <p>There was some concern that the current language doesn’t capture the need for creating partnerships. Other members noted a lack of guardrails for receiving private funding, that should be tied more clearly to advancing established resilience goals. It was suggested that this recommendation is specific to establishing mechanisms and that partnerships and guardrails may be beyond that scope. Additionally, it was shared that policies for localities accepting donations are already in place and may contain the needed guardrails.</p>

## RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

### Final Voting on Recommendations

Working Group members voted “Support”, “Abstain”, or “Do Not Support” for each recommendation, including the amendments on discussed recommendations below. No recommendation received a “Do Not Support” vote. Recommendations B.1, B.2, E.4, and H.1 received unanimous support with no abstaining votes. (The full voting results are listed on page 6 of this document.)

Previous Recommendation	Amended as of Sep 26, 2028
<p><b>B.2: The CRO should be authorized to serve as Virginia’s non-federal sponsor/applicant for USACE Civil Works Programs and other federal funding programs.</b> The CRO should be tasked with working across relevant agencies and localities to seek these funding opportunities and make applications on behalf of the Commonwealth. Where a specific agency or local government is required, or better suited, to be the applicant (such as the STORM program), the CRO will be designated to support the application, and lead coordination between agencies and ensure alignment with the Commonwealth’s overall resilience goals.</p>	<p><b>B.2: The CRO should be authorized to serve, at the request of and in coordination with, an eligible funding recipient, as Virginia’s non-federal sponsor or applicant for resilience related projects, depending on existing state agency activities and needs, USACE Civil Works Programs and other federal funding programs.</b> The CRO should be tasked with working across relevant agencies and localities to seek these funding opportunities and make applications on behalf of the Commonwealth. Where a specific agency or local government is required, or better suited, to be the applicant (such as the STORM program), the CRO will be designated to support the application, and lead coordination between agencies and ensure alignment with the Commonwealth’s overall resilience goals.</p>
<p><b>C.1: The state should provide capacity-building support to local governments seeking to address resilience challenges.</b> To ensure success, the state should consider the following actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>i. Providing support to localities from the Office of Resilience by establishing local support positions within the Office.</li><li>ii. Establishing “grant specialist/local support” positions to support select localities in procuring resilience funding, based on demonstrated need.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>a. Consider a structure that allows positions to work closely with or be embedded within PDCs serving under-resourced communities and share regional</li></ul></li></ul>	<p><b>C.1: The state should provide capacity-building support to local governments seeking to address resilience challenges.</b> To ensure success, the state should consider the following actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>i. Providing support to localities from the Office of Resilience by establishing local support positions within the Office.</li><li>ii. Establishing “grant specialist/local support” positions <b>outside of the Office</b> to support localities and PDCs in procuring resilience funding, based on demonstrated need.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li><del>a. Consider a structure that allows positions to work closely with or be embedded within PDCs serving under-resourced communities and share</del></li></ul></li></ul>

**RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP**

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

<p>information on local capacity back to the state’s resilience entities.</p> <p>b. Study these positions to determine the best placement and costs for these roles.</p> <p>c. Evaluate the Virginia DEQ CZM’s grants program and other agency structures as potential models (e.g., VDEM Regional Support structure within the VDEM Disaster Services Bureau).</p>	<p><del>regional information on local capacity back to the state’s resilience entities.</del></p> <p><del>b. Study these positions to determine the best placement and costs for these roles.</del></p> <p><del>c. Evaluate the Virginia DEQ CZM’s grants program and other agency structures as potential models (e.g., VDEM Regional Support structure within the VDEM Disaster Services Bureau).</del></p>
<p><b>C.2: The state should consider funding resilience tools, including the RAFT (Resilience Adaptation Feasibility Tool), a collaborative state university “boots on the ground” tool highlighted in Virginia’s Coastal Resilience Master Plan for supporting under-resourced local governments and federally and state recognized Tribes across the Commonwealth as well as other resilience tools that will help localities and recognized Tribes advance their resilience.</b></p>	<p><b>C.2: The state should consider funding resilience tools and processes that will help localities and state and federally recognized Tribes advance their resilience such as the RAFT (Resilience Adaptation Feasibility Tool).</b></p>
<p><b>E.1: The state should evaluate creating a mechanism to enable the use of private funding by state agencies.</b></p>	<p><b>E.1: The state should evaluate creating streamlined mechanism(s) to accept and enable the use of private funding, charitable funding and/or public-private partnerships by state agencies and localities seeking to address resilience challenges.</b></p>

**Public Comment**

After the group discussions, there was an opportunity for public comment. No public comment was received.

**Next Steps**

The voting record will be included in the final report that will be submitted to the Secretary of Natural and Historic Resources. The Secretary’s Office will make the final report available on their website. DCR will also ensure it is posted on their flood resilience website and distributed.

## RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

### Adjournment

Director Wells thanks for the members for their hard work and efforts throughout the work group process. The meeting adjourned at 3:35pm.

### Voting Results

Legislative Recommendations – Support (S), Abstain (A), Do Not Support (NS)

Name, Organization	A.1	A.2	A.3	A.4	A.5	A.6	B.1	B.2	B.3	C.1	C.2	D.1
Chesapeake Bay Commission, Adrienne Kotula	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Jay Ford	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Citizen Member, Elizabeth Andrews	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	A	S
Clark Nexsen, Chris Stone	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Conservation and Recreation, Matthew Wells	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Emergency Management, Robbie Coates	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Energy, David Hawkins	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Housing and Community Development, Bill Curtis	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Treasury, Bryan Chamberlain	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Environmental Quality, Sharon Baxter	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Transportation, Chris Swanson	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S	A	A	A	S

## RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

Name, Organization	A.1	A.2	A.3	A.4	A.5	A.6	B.1	B.2	B.3	C.1	C.2	D.1
Environmental Defense Fund, Emily Steinhilber	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Hampton Roads Planning District Commission, Whitney Katchmark	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Institute for Engagement and Negotiation, University of Virginia, Tanya Denckla Cobb	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Institute for Coastal Adaptation and Resilience, Old Dominion University, Dr. Jessica Whitehead	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Middle Peninsula Planning District Commission, Lewie Lawrence	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Secretary of Veterans and Defense Affairs, Jordan Stewart	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	A	A
Soil and Water Conservation Board, Chuck Arnason	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
The Nature Conservancy, Nikki Rovner	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Economic Development Partnership, Nicole Riley	S	A	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Agribusiness Council, Brad Copenhaver	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Association of Counties, Joe Lerch	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Association of Soil and Water Conservation Districts, Robert Pickett	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S

## RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

Name, Organization	A.1	A.2	A.3	A.4	A.5	A.6	B.1	B.2	B.3	C.1	C.2	D.1
Virginia Chamber of Commerce, Kristen Burhop	S	S	S	A	A	A	S	S	A	A	A	A
Virginia Farm Bureau, Katelyn Jordan	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Home Builders Association and the Virginia Manufacturers Association, Henry 'Speaker' Pollard	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Marine Resources Commission, Rachael Peabody	S	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Port Authority, Cathie Vick	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Resources Authority, Shawn Crumlish	S	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S

Administrative Recommendations – Support (S), Abstain (A), Do Not Support (NS)

Name, Organization	E.1	E.2	E.3	E.4	F.1	F.2	F.3	F.4	G.1	H.1	H.2
Chesapeake Bay Commission, Adrienne Kotula	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Jay Ford	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Citizen Member, Elizabeth Andrews	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Clark Nexsen, Chris Stone	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Conservation and Recreation, Matthew Wells	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Emergency Management, Robbie Coates	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Energy, David Hawkins	A	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S



# RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP

Meeting Summary September 26, 2023

Name, Organization	E.1	E.2	E.3	E.4	F.1	F.2	F.3	F.4	G.1	H.1	H.2
Department of Housing and Community Development, Bill Curtis	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Treasury, Bryan Chamberlain	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Environmental Quality, Sharon Baxter	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Department of Transportation, Chris Swanson	A	A	A	S	A	S	A	A	S	S	A
Environmental Defense Fund, Emily Steinhilber	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Hampton Roads Planning District Commission, Whitney Katchmark	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Institute for Coastal Adaptation and Resilience, Old Dominion University, Dr. Jessica Whitehead	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Institute for Engagement and Negotiation, University of Virginia, Tanya Denckla Cobb	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Middle Peninsula Planning District Commission, Lewie Lawrence	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Secretary of Veterans and Defense Affairs, Jordan Stewart	S	S	S	S	S	A	A	S	S	S	S
Soil and Water Conservation Board, Chuck Arnason	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
The Nature Conservancy, Nikki Rovner	S	S	A	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Economic Development Partnership, Nicole Riley	S	S	A	S	A	S	A	A	A	S	S
Virginia Agribusiness Council, Brad Copenhaver	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Association of Counties, Joe Lerch	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	A	A	S	S
Virginia Association of Soil and Water Conservation Districts, Robert Pickett	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S

**RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP**

*Meeting Summary September 26, 2023*

<b>Name, Organization</b>	<b>E.1</b>	<b>E.2</b>	<b>E.3</b>	<b>E.4</b>	<b>F.1</b>	<b>F.2</b>	<b>F.3</b>	<b>F.4</b>	<b>G.1</b>	<b>H.1</b>	<b>H.2</b>
Virginia Chamber of Commerce, Kristen Burhop	S	A	S	S	A	A	A	A	S	S	S
Virginia Farm Bureau, Katelyn Jordan	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Home Builders Association and the Virginia Manufacturers Association, Henry 'Speaker' Pollard	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Marine Resources Commission, Rachael Peabody	S	A	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S	S
Virginia Port Authority, Cathie Vick	S	S	A	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S
Virginia Resources Authority, Shawn Crumlish	S	S	S	S	S	A	S	S	S	S	S

**RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP***Meeting Summary September 26, 2023***Working Group Members and Alternates Attending**

<b>Organization</b>	<b>Representative</b>	<b>Alternate</b>
<b>Chesapeake Bay Commission</b>	Adrienne Kotula	
<b>Chesapeake Bay Foundation</b>	Jay Ford	
<b>City of Alexandria</b>		
<b>Clark Nexsen</b>	Chris Stone	
<b>Environmental Defense Foundation</b>	Emily Steinhilber	Grace Tucker
<b>Hampton Roads PDC</b>	Whitney Katchmark	
<b>Home Builders Association of Virginia / Virginia Manufacturing Association</b>	Speaker Pollard (Representing HBAV and the alternate for Virginia Manufacturing Association)	
<b>Institute for Coastal Adaptation and Resilience</b>	Jess Whitehead	Carol Considine
<b>Institute for Engagement &amp; Negotiation</b>	Tanya Denckla Cobb	
<b>Middle Peninsula PDC</b>	Lewis Lawrence	
<b>Port of Virginia`</b>	Cathie Vick	
<b>Secretary of Veterans and Defense Affairs</b>		Asst. Secretary Jordan Stewart
<b>Secretary of Natural and Historic Resources</b>	Secretary Travis Voyles	
<b>Soil and Water Conservation Board</b>	Chuck Arnason	
<b>The Nature Conservancy</b>	Nikki Rovner	
<b>Virginia Agribusiness Council</b>	Brad Copenhaver	
<b>Virginia Association of Counties</b>	Joe Lerch	
<b>VA Association of Soil and Water Conservation Districts</b>	Robert Pickett	
<b>Citizen</b>	Elizabeth Andrews	
<b>Virginia Chamber of Commerce</b>	Kristen Burhop	Ethan Betterton
<b>Virginia Department of Conservation and Recreation</b>	Matthew Wells	Andrew Smith
<b>Virginia Department of Emergency Management</b>		Robert Coates
<b>Virginia Department of Energy</b>	David Hawkins	
<b>Virginia Department of Environmental Quality</b>	Sharon Baxter	
<b>Virginia Department of Housing &amp; Community Development</b>	Bill Curtis	
<b>Virginia Department of the Treasury</b>		Bryan Chamberlain
<b>Virginia Department of Transportation</b>		Chris Swanson
<b>Virginia Department of Wildlife Resources</b>		

**RESILIENCE COORDINATION WORKING GROUP**

*Meeting Summary September 26, 2023*

<b>Organization</b>	<b>Representative</b>	<b>Alternate</b>
<b>Virginia Economic Development Partnership</b>	Nicole Riley	
<b>Virginia Farm Bureau</b>		Katelyn Jordan
<b>Virginia Institute of Marine Science</b>		
<b>Virginia Marine Resources Commission</b>	Rachael Peabody	
<b>Virginia PACE Authority</b>		
<b>Virginia Resources Authority</b>	Shawn Crumlish	

<b>Department of Conservation &amp; Recreation</b>		<b>Center for Public Policy at VCU</b>	
Matthew Dalon	Carolyn Heaps-Pecaro	Gina Barber	Wheeler Wood
Darryl Glover		Sarah Jackson	Addie Alexander